The Effects of Using Simulated Role Play in Teaching History to Secondary Students in Bhutan.

Lhatu

Abstract

This experimental study investigated the learning achievement of grade IX Bhutanese students using simulated role play technique in teaching and learning history. From a total of 180 grade IX students, 60 students were selected using cluster random sampling technique. Data were collected using multiple methods including questionnaire, students’ reflective journal and achievement test (pre-test and post-test). The key findings revealed that there were significant differences in the mean scores of the students after the integration of simulated role play technique in teaching history. Other finding of the study revealed that the students had positive opinion towards simulated role play technique as it brought positive difference in their learning achievement. Therefore, it is recommended for all teachers to incorporate simulated role play technique in the classroom to see immediate and gradual improvement in students’ learning achievement.

Keywords: learning achievement, experimental study, simulated role play, History

Introduction

History is the study of the past to bring an understanding to the present. Historians of different time defined history differently but all definitions had a common significance that is the change over time covering all aspects of human society. It is a description of past actions and events that happened among mankind which affected the social and political condition of the human race. It is the witness that appears to the passing of time, illuminates reality and brings us the enthusiasm to study bygone days. The study of history provides a foundation of insightful knowledge, grounded in the humanities and in the social sciences, that is useful for professional lives. Bourgoin et al. (2001) assert that without a strong foundation of social studies education, the ability of the citizen to contribute to their culture and society declines and there is a danger of losing one’s social identity. Our identity is our pride and self-esteem; we lose our identity when we are into material development. Ura et al. (2012) described that identity encompass cultures, traditions and belief in spiritual values such as compassion, peace, and sense of connectedness. Therefore, to keep our society balanced with material development and spiritual continuity, it is essential for its people to know and respect the history of the country. History education is one major form to keep
identity preserved and valued.

Barton and Levstik (2004) emphasized the role of history in helping citizens engage in collaboration towards a common good. Moreover, the subject provides an opportunity for students to understand and appreciate the inevitability of change and the need to develop historical empathy. It is of paramount importance in the society, and thus history as a subject was then implemented to be taught in Bhutanese schools under three themes namely Bhutan History, Civics and World/Indian History. Bhutan history and civics are intended to increase the students’ knowledge on country’s history and political situation. The integration of world/Indian history in the Bhutanese curriculum is to educate students on some of the major world events and its significance. Although it is essential to know and study one’s own history, students in Bhutanese schools find it difficult and boring and thus cannot score high marks in the examination. Over the years, history as a subject in the school curriculum has constantly suffered negative perceptions regardless of the emphasis placed on the importance of the subject by the Ministry of Education. History classes were taught using age old textbook based lecture method. The text books were not revised for years. A study carried out by Centre for Educational Research and Development (2009) to investigate pedagogical approach in classroom teaching and its effectiveness found that about 89% of teachers are still using lecture method while teaching in the classroom with minimal use of inquiry.

History is one subject that is not held in high esteem among Bhutanese students. The performance of grade X students’ in history during the Bhutan Certificate of Secondary Education Examination held in December 2016 was not encouraging. The overall mean marks of History, Civics and Geography (HCG) was lowest compared to other subjects as reflected in Table 1. The paradox is humanities subjects especially history is considered as one of the easiest subjects to study in general by the students.
Table 1
The Performance of Grade X Students in History in Bhutan Certificate of Secondary Education, 2016 Compared to other Subjects

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Subject</th>
<th>Average Score (%)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dzongkha</td>
<td>66.99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economics</td>
<td>64.70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Math</td>
<td>64.33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>History Civics &amp; Geography</td>
<td>62.76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Science (Chemistry, Physics, &amp; Biology)</td>
<td>70.85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Computer Applications</td>
<td>76.56</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environmental Science</td>
<td>66.08</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The press release from Department of School Education, Ministry of Education (MoE), Bhutan (2017) also revealed that, the performance of Bhutanese students in history was not up to satisfaction. Students could not perform well in history, though history is considered as one of the easy subjects to study in general. The students’ performance in Bhutan Higher Secondary Education Certificate (BHSEC) 2017 revealed that only 4.74% of students could score marks in the range of 81 - 100 which is lowest compared to other subjects (e.g., 8.89% of students scored in the range of 81 – 100 in economics, 5.61% in mathematics, 38.48% in computer application and 11.37% in environmental science).

Students lack of understanding of historical concepts may be attributed to the teacher centred teaching where teachers act as the source of knowledge and students as the recipients. Most of the time students are made to memorise entire texts; syllabus coverage is given more consideration than students’ learning. As a result, students are not competent and confident in their examination. Therefore, this study was carried out to find the effectiveness of simulated role play technique in the teaching of history. Several researchers have recommended that simulated role play is an active learning technique that motivates learning and enhances students’ interest towards studying history through its unique mechanisms and the experiences that every individual will acquire after attending the history lesson (e.g., Andersson & Andersson, 2010; Auman, 2011).
Literature Review

Simulated role play is a teaching technique that has been used widely for experiential learning and provides an imaginary context in which issues and behaviors may be discovered by students who take on a precise role or character. To present an insightful simulated role play, students explore, prepare and are determined to engage themselves to create effective scenario. Silvia (2012) argues that students are not satisfied with the act they played because the act did not seem realistic; however, the experience certainly seemed worthwhile and inspiring. Simulated role play builds in students the skills of interpersonal and relational challenge by engaging themselves in communication, negotiation and decision making. Through these processes students realize not only how it feels to be part of their act but also the importance of their ongoing relations with friends.

Hou (2012) states that simulated role play improve learners’ communication skills and develop problem-solving abilities. When participating in role-play, learners explore a difficult situation that requires resolution through discussion, debate, and negotiation among roles with differing views. It gives opportunities for learners to apply their prior knowledge in contexts and receive the consequences of actions in safe environments. Research shows that simulated role-playing benefits learning in several ways (Dracup, 2008). Firstly, it produces deep-level learning outcomes that is retained for a long time. It is a strategy to promote experiential learning. Learning by doing is a process where meaningful learning takes place. Secondly, it engages both learners and facilitators. That is, learners are inclined to enjoy the experiential learning experiences (hands on experience). Thirdly, role-play can support students develop problem-solving skills by assuming different roles situated in complex problem scenarios relevant to the professional domain (Hou, 2012). McCarthy and Anderson (2000) defend that the effectiveness of a simulated role-plays would be lost, unless the students read and rehearse their role carefully under the instructor’s guidance. The students practice the role of their own, under the guidance of their teacher and work cooperatively for a common goal. To make the scenario interesting and engaging the students need to put collective effort, so that they feel the difference in active and passive learning.

Andersson and Andersson (2010) highlight that simulated role play not only helped in general improvement in learning achievement but also in active involvement required in creating the situation which promotes enhanced enthusiasm, motivation, and a positive attitude to the teaching subject. Simulated role play combines the skills of cognitive and affective domains of learning (feel and think). It also promotes oral communication and written skills as the students have to take up the role of real character, they should be spontaneous and realistic. Simulated role play technique provides a platform for the students to develop basic
life skills such as communication, analyzing and critical thinking and decision making skills.

According to McLaughlin, Kirkpatrick, Hirsch, and Maier (2012), simulated role play involves decision-making and conflict resolution. It involves participants deliberately adopting a role for a specific purpose. It is a simplification of reality that maintains the essential functions of the simulated environment. Simulated role play is considered important in a classroom because it recreates dramatic quality of situation of the historical setting. It teaches empathy to students for social conscience, encourage and inspire active involvement in classroom activity. To have a meaningful and memorable learning experience through simulated role play, motivating students with praise and reward are the basic ways to develop high self-esteem resulting in building confidence of the students.

**Research objectives**

1. To examine the learning achievement of grade 9 students using simulated role play to teach history.
2. To find out the opinion of the students towards simulated role play in teaching history.

**Research questions**

1. What is the effect of simulated role play on students’ learning achievement?
2. What is the opinion of students towards simulated role play in learning history?

**Methodology**

This study adopted a mixed methods research design; a combination of qualitative and quantitative approaches. The researcher adopted parallel mixed methods approach because this approach can give a better perspective of the problem and produce more complete evidence in terms of both depth and breadth. This approach can also strengthen findings through the triangulation of qualitative and quantitative data. Barnes (2012) supports the popularity of mixed methods research in social science that mixed methods research is a unique form of social enquiry with its own set of philosophical, methodological and practical guidelines.

The study employed an experimental research design with two groups of students - one as an experimental group and other as a control group. The targeted population of the study was 6 sections of grade 9 students (80 boys and 100 girls) in one of the central schools in Southern Bhutan. The cluster random sampling technique was used to select 2 sections consisting of 30 students each with mixed gender and mixed ability. The age group of the students ranged from 14-18 years.
old. The experimental group was taught with simulated role play technique and the control group was taught using traditional lecture method as reflected in Figure 1.

Figure 1

Illustration of the Research Procedure

The researcher developed 40 multiple choice questions from two chapters of Bhutan civics grade IX textbook which were validated by three experts. 25 best items were selected for the achievement test based on experts’ recommendation. Pre-test and post-test was administered to compare the differences in learning achievement of the participants before and after the lesson intervention. In order to collect the opinion of the student on simulated role play, a 20-item questionnaire was designed and students were asked to indicate the extent of their agreement with each statement on a five-point Likert scale. Research participants in experimental group were asked to write 4 journals reflecting on the strengths and limitations of simulated role play in teaching history. A professor from Rangsit University, Thailand and a lecturer from Samtse College of education, Bhutan validated the instruments of the study. To check the reliability of the learning outcome test questions, a pilot test was conducted and KR-20 coefficient was calculated using Kuder-Richardson formula (KR-20). The KR-20 coefficient was 0.809 which was greater than 0.70, this indicated that the learning outcome test was reliable. Similarly Cronbach’s alpha (α) for questionnaire was computed using SPSS software. The Cronbach’s alpha was 0.792 which was greater than 0.70, this indicated that questionnaire was reliable.
Findings

The findings are presented under two themes namely i) effect of simulated role play on students’ learning achievement and ii) student’s opinion towards learning history through simulated role play.

Effect of Simulated Role Play on Students’ Learning Achievement

The first objective of the study was to examine the learning achievement of grade IX students in history using simulated role play. For this objective, a comparative statistical analysis was done using mean and standard deviation and significance level P-value as presented in Table 2. The comparison was done ‘within the group’ by comparing the pre-test and post-test of the group.

Table 2

Pre-test and Post-test Comparison

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Group</th>
<th>Test</th>
<th>Mean</th>
<th>Mean Difference</th>
<th>Standard Deviation</th>
<th>Sig. (2 tailed)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Control</td>
<td>Pre-test</td>
<td>7.82</td>
<td></td>
<td>2.72</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Post-test</td>
<td>14.52</td>
<td>7</td>
<td>3.82</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Experimental</td>
<td>Pre-test</td>
<td>8.04</td>
<td></td>
<td>3.49</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Post-test</td>
<td>22.65</td>
<td>14.61</td>
<td>1.89</td>
<td>0.00</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Significance level: P< 0.05-significant

From Table 2 it is apparent that the mean of the pre-test and the post-test scores of control group were 7.82 and 14.52 respectively. The mean of the pre-test and post-test scores of experimental group were 8.04 and 22.65 respectively. The mean difference of pre-test and post-test of the control group was 7.00 and the mean difference of pretest and posttest of experimental group was 14.61 resulting to the significance value (p) 0.00 which indicates that there was statistically significant increase in the students’ scores in the post-test when compared to their pre-test in both the groups. The details of comparison within the group is presented in Figure 2.
Figure 2

Comparison of Pre-test and Post-test within the Group

Students’ Opinion towards Learning History through Simulated Role Play

Students’ reflective journal was another instrument used by the researcher to collect data for the second objective of the research which was aimed at examining the opinion of students towards the use of simulated role play in teaching and learning history. The data from the student’s reflective journal was analyzed using grounded theory proposed by Strauss and Corbin (1998). The data collected from student’s reflective journal were organized systemically and categorized into the following six sub-themes. The identified sub-themes were: (1) learning by doing for better understanding, (2) fun and interesting, (3) build team spirit, (4) engaging, (5) motivated learning and (6) gained confidence as discussed in turn below.

Learning by Doing for Better Understanding

The main purpose of this study was to check the effectiveness of the simulated role play technique in teaching and learning history by providing hands on experience. Since most of the history lessons are associated with traditional approaches, learning by doing was not taking place. The analysis of the student’s reflective journal revealed that they understood the content better and additionally also got an opportunity to explore more on the topics when history concepts were taught through simulation. For instance, Student 1 (S1) expressed that simulated role play helped him comprehend history better through hands on and by actually engaging him in the lesson and not simply listening to the teacher’s lecture.

I am happy to learn history with simulated role play as it gives us an opportunity to learn by doing (S1)
Similarly, other students are also expressed that this strategy helped them understand history concepts better as detailed below:

*History learning through simulated role play makes us understand better on historical perspectives. We get chance to see the reality (S2)*

*I learned more than I expected because I did it instead of listening about it (S15)*

*By doing role play and simulation we become very active as a result we learn more. It is better than sitting and listening to what teacher teaches (S23)*

**Fun and Interesting**

The simulated role play technique required students to be in others shoes since it required them to act the role which was assigned to them. The students simulated the national election process including public campaign, candidate debates and the election process. The reflection from the student’s journal revealed that the simulated role play was fun, interesting and enjoyable.

For instance, Student 10 expressed that:

*I feel fun and interesting to simulate role play because we have to act differently but we learn while acting (S10)*

Further, Student 4 expressed that simulated role play not only enhances their learning but also kept them awake and active in the class:

*I enjoy learning history through simulated role play because we learn more when we act if not we often sleep learning from the text (S4)*

Likewise other students too expressed that simulation strategy required them to interact and discuss with friends which helped them acquire new ideas and knowledge as expressed by Student 8.

*It is exciting to learn history through simulated role play because we get new knowledge and ideas from friends (S8)*

Further, this strategy requires them to move out of the classroom into the auditorium for want of bigger space or related sites depending on the topic. Majority of the students reflected that going outside and studying in the open air or new venue is fun and refreshing rather than sitting in the same classroom which could become quite monotonous. For instance, Student 3 expressed:

*Going out of the classroom and learning in the environment related to the topics is fun and knowledgeable. It is very interesting to work in a group and simulate the role play (S3)*
Built Team Spirit

Collaboration and cooperation are the fundamental components of the simulated role play technique. Without the enthusiastic support from team mates the target or the objectives cannot be achieved. To achieve the set objectives, everybody should come to a common understanding and work towards a common goal. The feeling of unity among team members will foster team spirit.

It was evident from students’ reflective journal that every member of the group was valued and respected. Every member cooperated and worked for the common goal as expressed by Student 14 and Student 6 below.

Role play and simulation is all to do with cooperation. If we do not work in a group we fail to reach our objectives. So every member in a group cooperates to come up with successful simulated role play (S14)

We worked in the group and individual responses are respected and valued. Discussions are made in group that encourages us to communicate and know each other (S6)

Engaging

Simulated role play is a part of active learning. Engaging students with the materials and allowing them to collaborate with each other are essential elements of active learning. Engaging students in the learning process increases their attention and focus, motivates them to practice higher-level critical thinking skills and promotes meaningful learning experiences.

Students’ journal revealed that since this strategy requires them to fully engage in the activity, they did not feel bored or put to sleep unlike other classes. Considering the fact that simulated role play technique is not a one man’s show, students reflected that they learnt better and wished for such techniques to be integrated while teaching every topic in history as marked by Student 22 and Student 29:

I often sleep in the history class but I didn’t this time because I am fully engaged in discussion with group member for the role play. If all the topics are taught in this way we will learn more and perform better in examination (S22)

To perform simulated role play everybody is actively involved so it is not one man’s show. Every individual gets equal opportunities as a result we learn better than listening to lecture (S29)
Motivated Learning

Motivation was one of the recurring themes that emerged from students’ reflective journal. Recognizing student’s work through praise and incentives generated interest and motivation among the students as expressed below.

*We are motivated to participate in the simulated role play because our works are recognized and valued. I see all my friends put equal effort in their work as they want to get the reward from the teacher (S7)*

*Awarding of prizes to the best performing group motivate us to perform better in the next lesson. We motivate our self and work collaboratively so that our group can get the reward prepared by the teacher (S18)*

*By simulating a role play it motivate us to participate in the class because we learn more things if we participate than remaining silent (S12)*

Gained Confidence

Integration of simulated role play technique in the teaching and learning history enhanced student’s confidence level. Unlike the traditional approach where few students dominate the class discussion and side track quiet students, the integration of simulated role play technique in teaching history required every student to participate and give their best effort to achieve the collective goal. As a result they gain confidence and participate in the class discussion without having to coerce as evident from the journal reflection of the following students.

*By simulating a role play we gain confidence to speak in the crowd. Through role play and simulation we do not forget what we learn (S9)*

*Participating in the role play and simulation makes me feel confident. Now I can speak confidently though I make mistakes (S30)*

*I think role play and simulation is giving me an opportunity to become confident person in future because I get chance to act and speak in the class (S28)*

The analysis of survey data on the opinion of the students towards simulated role play technique in teaching history revealed that the students were very positive about this strategy as evident from the very high mean score as reflected in Figure 3. For instance, the student’s average rating on the statement: Interest in studying history with simulated role play technique is 4.5 (Agree), followed by very high average score of 4.4 for simulated role play technique motivate learning; 4.4 for satisfaction after integration of simulated role play technique; and 4.5 for easiness in learning history with the use of simulated role play technique.
As evident from the analysis of student’s reflective journal and survey data, simulated role play technique brought a significant change in their attitude towards history lesson. Students reflected that such techniques can do away with the drawbacks of the traditional approaches and help them develop interest towards the subjects. The students expressed that they were able to apply the learnt lesson in different situations as the knowledge and experience acquired could be retained for a longer duration. Further, they also mentioned that simulated role play technique helped them demonstrate a process, analyze an argument, or apply a concept to a real-world situation. From the statement, it was clear that simulated role play technique not only brought change in learning style but also encouraged students to participate actively in every lesson. Thus, it can be concluded that integration of simulated role play technique is suitable for teaching and learning history.

**Discussion**

This study presents two major findings. The first finding was that integration of simulated role play technique in teaching history enhanced the learning achievement of grade IX students. There was a positive difference in the learning achievement of the students as reflected in Table1. The second finding was that students had positive opinion towards simulated role play technique in studying history. The data from questionnaire and students’ reflective journal proved that students enjoyed studying history with the use of simulated role play technique. The techniques helped them increase their interest to study history, and students were also satisfied with their achievement in their result.
The first finding of the study revealed that integration of simulated role play technique in teaching history enhanced the learning achievement of the students. For instance, the mean scores of the experimental students in pre-test were just 8.04 but after the simulated role play technique was applied, the mean score in the post-test increased to 22.65. The positive difference in the learning achievement of the students was in line with the study carried out by Islam and Islam (2013) who found that students enthusiastically accepted simulated role play technique as it challenges their creativity and ability to think critically, which enables them to speak more logically and confidently in the classroom. Similar finding was reported by Bhattacharjee (2014) that the simulated role play technique foster students to demonstrate improved learning outcome and broader perspective on the attitude towards their learning. It also offers students an active learning environment that balances theory and practical and also encourages students to develop critical thinking and logical reasoning skills.

The study by Brummel, Gunsalus, Anderson and Loui (2010) investigated the effectiveness of simulated role play as an active learning pedagogy over traditional approaches in achieving significant learning outcomes and found out that lessons learned with the integration of simulated role play was worthwhile as it is engaging. The study also revealed that student’s attentions were captured towards the assigned work resulting in realistic learning experience. Thus, the finding of this study to examine the learning achievement of students through simulated role play is supported.

The second objective of the study was to explore the opinion of students towards simulated role play. The findings from the questionnaire and students’ reflective journal revealed that simulated role play technique increased students’ content knowledge. The finding from this study was in parallel with the findings of Wiskin, Roberts, and Roalfe (2011) that studied the impact of discussing a sexual history in simulated role-play teaching on pre-clinical student attitudes towards people who submit for STI (Sexually Transmitted Infection) testing. The study brought the change in a number of students who had medical examination for STI. At first the students were reluctant for the medical examination; it was British white students who came for the check-up followed by others. So the students view simulated role play as the technique that had the ability to convince people about the cause and effect.

Similarly, Schnurr, De Santo, Green and Taylor’s (2015) study to investigate Student Perceptions of Knowledge Acquisition within a Role-Play Simulation of the Convention on Biological Diversity found that after participating in the simulated role play, students mean ratings of their knowledge on topics were significantly higher than initial ratings. The study revealed that the students
significantly improved their knowledge on all of the main topics addressed in the simulation. This suggests that, on average, students felt that simulated role play improved their understanding of the course and made a positive difference in their learning and knowledge acquisition.

**Conclusion**

Numerous studies were carried out to examine student’s opinion on effectiveness of simulated role play. For instance, both Chasek (2005) and Frederking’s (2005) study showed that final exam scores improved as a result of integrating simulated role-play technique. Similarly, a control and experimental group study by Baranowski (2006) and Kraina and Lantis (2006) too revealed the effectiveness of simulated role play that created a significant difference in the scores of the students involved in control and experimental group. Moreover, students were able to develop and practice interpersonal and relational skills as part of the simulated role play.

Similar results were also obtained in this study. The achievement test of the students after the integration of simulated role play improved their score from 8.04 to 22.65 which was a significant increase indicating that this technique has the ability to create positive difference in the students’ learning achievement. Correspondingly, the data from opinion questionnaire also proved that simulated role play technique brought change in the opinion and thought of the students with the overall mean of 4.45 out of 5 on the Likert scale. Lastly, the data from the students’ reflective journal revealed that simulated role play technique brought a significant change in the attitudes of the students to study History.

Therefore, it can be concluded that simulated role play is an active learning technique that not only creates difference in the learning achievement of the student but also develops positive experience and gain confidence.

Based on the results of this study, teachers are advised to incorporate simulated role play technique in the classroom to improve students’ learning achievement and it can be applied in teaching most subjects across the school curriculum.
References


Centre for Educational Research & Development, Bhutan. (2009). *RABSEL, the*


---

### About the Author

**Lhatu** is a teacher at Kamji Central School. He has B. Ed (history) from Paro College of Education, Bhutan and Master of Education from Rangsit University, Thailand. To his credit he has ten years of teaching experience at middle secondary and central schools. His action research titled An Investigation of Middle Secondary School Students’ Assertiveness was published by BON VIEW Publishing PTE. LTD. based at Singapore.